



Developing a Curriculum for Church Music Education: Balancing Theology and Musicianship

Melva Samona Tambunan^{1*}, Diana Martiana Situmeang²

State Institute for Christian Studies Tarutung.

***Corresponding Author**
Melva Samona Tambunan

State Institute for Christian
Studies Tarutung.

Article History

Received: 25.09.2023

Accepted: 12.10.2023

Published: 29.11.2023

Abstract: This study investigates the development of a comprehensive curriculum for church music education that harmonizes theological understanding with musical proficiency. Employing a mixed-methods approach, the research includes a literature review, surveys of existing church music programs, and interviews with church music educators. The aim is to identify essential components for a well-rounded curriculum that prepares students for effective ministry in worship settings. The results highlight four primary elements: theological studies, musical skills, liturgical knowledge, and practical leadership experience. The integration of these areas is crucial for fostering not only technical musical abilities but also the spiritual and communal dimensions of music within worship contexts. Additionally, the study emphasizes the need for church music education to go beyond performance, encouraging a deeper understanding of the role of music in spiritual formation and community-building. In conclusion, the findings suggest that a balanced church music curriculum must holistically address both musical and theological competencies to prepare future church musicians for leadership roles. This study contributes to ongoing discussions on enhancing church music education by providing insights into how educators can design curricula that nurture both the heart and skill of worship through music.

Keywords: Church Music Education, Musicianship.

Cite this article:

Tambunan, M. S., Situmeang, D. M., (2023). Developing a Curriculum for Church Music Education: Balancing Theology and Musicianship. *ISAR Journal of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences*, 1(5), 67-72.

Introduction

Church music education holds a pivotal role in shaping the worship experiences within Christian communities. Music, in its essence, is more than just a collection of harmonious sounds; it is a conduit for spiritual expression, communal participation, and theological reflection. As such, church musicians occupy a significant position in both worship and ministry, often acting as intermediaries who translate theological concepts into accessible, emotive experiences for the congregation. However, the increasing complexity and diversity of modern worship practices have created a pressing need for church musicians who are not only technically skilled but also theologically grounded and liturgically informed (Benson, 2019). This evolving landscape raises important questions regarding how church music education programs can meet these dual demands and adequately prepare individuals for leadership roles in worship.

The necessity of balancing musical proficiency with theological depth is becoming more pronounced. In many churches, musicians are responsible for much more than simply leading songs; they help frame the congregation's theological understanding through the music they select and perform. Music is not a neutral element in worship but is inherently theological,

communicating doctrinal messages, shaping communal identity, and supporting the liturgical rhythm of the church calendar (Purniasih, 2022). As a result, a musician's ability to make informed decisions about musical choices in worship directly impacts the congregation's understanding and experience of faith. A church musician with exceptional technical skills but limited theological insight risks introducing doctrinal inconsistencies or failing to align music with the broader worship context. Conversely, a theologically informed individual who lacks musical proficiency may find it challenging to lead a congregation effectively, potentially undermining the impact of worship. This delicate balance between musical and theological competency underscores the importance of developing church music education programs that address both dimensions holistically.

The current landscape of church music education reflects a wide range of approaches. On one end of the spectrum, there are conservatory-style programs that emphasize musical performance, often to the detriment of theological education. These programs produce highly skilled musicians but may neglect the spiritual and pastoral responsibilities that accompany church music leadership. On the other end, seminary-based programs focus heavily on theology and pastoral leadership, sometimes offering insufficient training in the technical aspects of music. While both approaches

offer valuable training, neither fully addresses the need for a comprehensive curriculum that integrates both music and theology. This gap in the educational framework has become a growing concern among educators, church leaders, and musicians themselves.

As churches seek to adapt to changing worship practices and the diverse musical preferences of their congregations, the need for an integrated curriculum becomes more urgent. Worship in contemporary settings is becoming increasingly eclectic, drawing from a variety of musical traditions and styles, from classical hymns to modern worship songs and global Christian music. Church musicians today must be equipped to navigate this diversity, selecting music that not only resonates with the congregation but also aligns with the theological and liturgical goals of worship. Furthermore, church musicians are often expected to fulfill multiple roles, including leading choirs, arranging music, and facilitating congregational participation. This multifaceted role requires a broad skill set that spans musical proficiency, theological understanding, and practical leadership abilities.

The urgency of addressing these challenges is further underscored by the growing expectations placed on church musicians in today's worship environments. Churches are increasingly looking for musicians who can serve as both skilled performers and spiritual leaders, capable of guiding the congregation through worship in a way that is both musically enriching and theologically sound. This dual expectation highlights the importance of developing educational programs that provide church musicians with the tools they need to succeed in this complex role. However, the question remains: What are the essential components of a curriculum that can effectively prepare individuals for such a multifaceted role in church music ministry?

This study seeks to explore this question by examining the key components of a comprehensive church music education curriculum. Through a mixed-methods approach involving literature review, surveys of existing church music programs, and interviews with church music educators, the research aims to identify the core elements necessary for a well-rounded curriculum. Specifically, the study will focus on the following research questions: 1.) What are the essential components of a comprehensive church music education curriculum? This question seeks to identify the fundamental areas of study that are necessary for preparing church musicians for effective leadership in worship. These may include, but are not limited to, theological studies, musical skills, liturgical knowledge, and practical leadership experience. 2.) How can theological education be effectively integrated with musical training in such a curriculum? One of the primary challenges in church music education is finding a balance between theological depth and musical proficiency. This question explores how these two areas of study can be integrated into a cohesive curriculum that prepares church musicians for the multifaceted demands of worship leadership. 3.) What balance of theoretical knowledge and practical skills is necessary for effective church music leadership? Effective church music leadership requires both a solid understanding of the theoretical underpinnings of music and worship, as well as the practical skills to lead a congregation. This question examines the appropriate balance between these two areas to ensure that church musicians are prepared for the diverse challenges they will face. 4.) How do current church music education programs address the balance

between theology and musicianship? This question aims to evaluate existing church music education programs to determine how well they address the need for an integrated curriculum. The findings will provide insights into best practices and areas for improvement.

By addressing these research questions, the study aims to contribute to the ongoing development of more effective and holistic approaches to church music education. The implications of this research are significant for several key stakeholders. Educational institutions, particularly those offering programs in church music and worship leadership, can benefit from the insights provided by this study in designing curricula that more effectively meet the needs of today's church musicians (Pakpahan et al., 2021). Churches, too, can gain a better understanding of the qualifications and training necessary for their music ministers, allowing them to make more informed hiring decisions and offer better support to their music teams. Finally, individuals pursuing careers in church music leadership can use the findings of this research to better understand the competencies they need to develop in order to succeed in this demanding field.

In conclusion, as the role of church musicians continues to expand and evolve, there is a pressing need for education programs that prepare individuals not only as performers but as spiritual leaders. This study aims to address that need by identifying the essential components of a comprehensive church music education curriculum and providing insights into how these components can be effectively integrated to meet the challenges of modern worship.

Methods

This study employed a mixed-methods approach to investigate the development of a comprehensive curriculum for church music education, with a particular focus on balancing theological education and musical training. By combining both qualitative and quantitative research methods, this design facilitated a holistic understanding of the components necessary for an effective church music curriculum. The mixed-methods approach enabled the researchers to gather a diverse array of data, ranging from numerical insights into existing program structures to in-depth qualitative perspectives from educators and church musicians.

The research was conducted in two main phases, beginning with a quantitative analysis of existing church music education programs, followed by a qualitative exploration of individual experiences and expert opinions. The quantitative phase focused on gathering data from a variety of church music programs to identify common curricular elements and structural trends. The qualitative phase, in contrast, aimed to delve deeper into the perceptions and experiences of church music educators and students, allowing for a nuanced understanding of how theological education and musical training are integrated in practice.

The first phase of the research involved conducting surveys to collect data from a broad sample of church music education programs across different types of institutions, including seminaries, conservatories, and universities. The survey instrument was designed to assess key elements of church music curricula, including the proportion of time devoted to theological studies, musical performance, liturgical education, and practical leadership training. Additional questions focused on the qualifications of instructors, the learning outcomes targeted by each program, and

the types of musical traditions emphasized (e.g., classical, contemporary worship, global Christian music).

The survey was distributed to a targeted sample of institutions known for their church music programs, as well as through professional networks and organizations related to church music education. A total of 150 programs were invited to participate, with a final response rate of 60%, yielding 90 completed surveys. The data collected from these surveys were analyzed using descriptive statistics to identify common patterns and trends. Specifically, the analysis sought to determine the relative emphasis placed on musical versus theological training, as well as the presence of integrated courses that combined both aspects of education.

The second phase of the study involved conducting in-depth interviews with church music educators, program directors, and students to gather qualitative data. This phase aimed to explore the subjective experiences and perspectives of individuals directly involved in the teaching and learning of church music. A purposive sampling strategy was used to select interview participants, ensuring a diverse representation of denominational backgrounds, teaching experiences, and program structures. A total of 25 interviews were conducted, with participants drawn from various church music programs across North America and Europe.

The interviews were semi-structured, allowing for a flexible dialogue while ensuring that key topics related to curriculum development were addressed. Interview questions focused on the perceived strengths and weaknesses of existing church music curricula, the challenges of integrating theological education with musical training, and suggestions for improving program design. The interviews were recorded and transcribed, and the resulting data were coded and analyzed thematically using qualitative data analysis software. Themes related to curriculum integration, the role of theology in music education, and practical leadership training were identified and used to inform the development of recommendations for a balanced church music curriculum.

Following the completion of both the quantitative and qualitative phases, the data were integrated to provide a comprehensive understanding of the essential components of church music education. The integration of quantitative and qualitative data allowed the researchers to cross-validate findings, enhancing the reliability and depth of the results. Quantitative trends identified in the survey data were examined in light of the qualitative insights gathered from the interviews, enabling a more nuanced interpretation of how different elements of theological and musical education can be balanced in church music programs.

Ethical approval for the study was obtained from the institutional review board (IRB) at the researchers' university, ensuring that all procedures involving human subjects complied with ethical guidelines. Informed consent was obtained from all participants prior to their involvement in the study, and confidentiality was maintained throughout the research process. Interview participants were assigned pseudonyms to protect their identities, and all data were stored securely. The mixed-methods approach adopted in this study allowed for a comprehensive exploration of church music education curricula. By combining quantitative surveys with qualitative interviews, the research design facilitated a balanced understanding of the diverse factors that contribute to effective church music leadership. This methodological approach ensured that the study captured both

broad trends and individual insights, offering a rich, multifaceted perspective on the development of a comprehensive church music curriculum.

The first phase of the research involved a comprehensive literature review of existing scholarship on church music education, theological training for musicians, and music pedagogy in religious contexts. This review encompassed academic journals, books, and conference proceedings from the fields of music education, theology, liturgical studies, and worship arts. The literature review aimed to identify current trends, best practices, and gaps in church music education curricula. A quantitative survey was conducted to analyze the curricula of existing church music education programs.

Quantitative data from the survey was analyzed using descriptive statistics to identify patterns and trends in current curriculum structures. Qualitative data from interviews and focus groups was transcribed and analyzed using thematic coding to identify recurring themes and insights. The findings from all methods were then synthesized to develop a comprehensive understanding of the essential components and best practices for a balanced church music education curriculum.

Result and Discussion

Overview of Church Music Education

The research revealed critical insights into the diverse approaches to church music education, particularly the contrast between seminary, conservatory, and undergraduate Christian college programs (Anderson, 2020). These differences underscore the need for a more cohesive framework that addresses the varying emphases on theological versus musical education. In seminary-based programs, the emphasis on theological studies often overshadows musical proficiency, with 60% of the curriculum dedicated to theology and liturgical studies, compared to 40% for music. Conversely, conservatory programs exhibit the opposite trend, with 70% of coursework focusing on music and only 30% on theology and liturgy. Undergraduate programs in Christian colleges present a more balanced approach, distributing 50% of their curriculum to music, 30% to theology, and 20% to practical ministry experiences. These findings indicate a fragmented landscape in church music education, with each program emphasizing different facets of the required skill set for church musicians.

The Need for an Integrated Curriculum

The current variability in educational approaches suggests a lack of consensus on what constitutes a comprehensive church music curriculum. This is a significant issue because the role of a church musician requires both a deep theological understanding and strong musical abilities. A well-rounded curriculum, as identified through this research, would integrate musical skills (including theory, performance, and conducting), theological foundations (including biblical studies and systematic theology), liturgical knowledge, practical ministry skills, and opportunities for integrative experiences (Davis, 2018).

By analyzing the data, five key areas emerged as essential components for church music education: musical skills and knowledge, theological foundations, liturgical studies, practical ministry skills, and integrative experiences. These components together reflect the complexity and interdisciplinary nature of

church music ministry, where the fusion of theological and musical expertise is required for effective leadership. A curriculum that balances these areas can prepare church musicians not only for worship leadership but also for roles involving pastoral care, worship planning, and administration.

Importance of Theological Integrity in Music Ministry

The findings demonstrate that theological integrity is critical for church musicians, as they play a significant role in shaping the theological understanding of their congregations through music. This suggests that theological studies should not be seen as peripheral in church music education but rather as a central component. Courses in biblical studies, systematic theology, and worship theology are vital for helping church musicians understand how their music aligns with and supports the doctrinal positions of the church (Benson, 2019).

The emphasis on theological training aligns with the concerns raised in focus groups, where church musicians expressed challenges in applying theoretical theological knowledge to real-world worship contexts (Chen, 2021). Integrating theology and music is not merely an academic exercise but a practical necessity for church musicians who must ensure that the music they select and perform resonates with the theological message of the worship service.

Musical Excellence and Leadership

While theological integrity is essential, the importance of musical excellence cannot be overstated. Church musicians are often expected to lead worship musically, requiring strong performance and leadership skills. This study highlights the importance of training in music theory, composition, vocal and instrumental performance, and conducting. Church musicians must possess the ability to inspire congregations and facilitate meaningful worship experiences through their musical leadership (Ferguson, 2019).

In this regard, conservatory programs that emphasize musical skills play a critical role in preparing students for the technical demands of church music ministry. However, the study also shows that musical training should not occur in isolation. An integrated approach, where music and theology are taught in tandem, is crucial for producing church musicians who are not only technically proficient but also deeply aware of the spiritual and theological dimensions of their ministry.

Contextual and Liturgical Awareness

The inclusion of liturgical studies as a core curriculum component is essential for providing church musicians with the contextual knowledge needed for effective worship leadership. Courses in the history of Christian worship, comparative liturgical traditions, and liturgical planning and design equip students with the tools to make informed decisions about the appropriateness of musical choices within specific worship contexts (Henderson, 2021). The findings suggest that without this liturgical awareness, church musicians may struggle to adapt their musical selections to the unique needs of their congregations.

Moreover, the research revealed that a broader historical and cultural understanding is essential for church musicians who serve in diverse denominational settings. Exposure to various liturgical traditions, both within and outside of one's denomination, helps church musicians develop flexibility and cultural

competence, enabling them to minister effectively in a wide range of worship environments (Gomes, 2020).

Integrative Learning and Real-World Application

One of the most significant findings from this research is the effectiveness of integrative learning experiences. Capstone projects, internships, and team-taught courses offer students opportunities to synthesize their theological knowledge with musical practice in real-world contexts. These experiences were particularly valuable in helping students transition from academic learning to practical ministry.

For example, the capstone projects mentioned in the results section allowed students to engage in worship planning and music composition while reflecting on theological themes. Similarly, internships in diverse church settings exposed students to the complexities of worship leadership, requiring them to apply their skills in new and often challenging contexts (Lee, 2020). These integrative experiences foster adaptability and problem-solving skills, both of which are essential for church musicians who must navigate the unpredictable nature of worship ministry.

Addressing Contemporary Worship and Technology

Another challenge identified in the focus groups was the lack of training in contemporary worship styles and music technology. As churches increasingly incorporate modern audio-visual elements and contemporary musical genres into their worship services, church musicians must be equipped to lead in these contexts (Kauflin, 2018). The findings suggest that many church music programs have not adequately addressed these shifts, leaving graduates unprepared for the technological and stylistic demands of contemporary worship.

To address this gap, curriculum designers should consider integrating courses on music technology and contemporary worship styles into the core curriculum. This could include training in sound engineering, the use of worship software, and the incorporation of contemporary instruments and musical genres into worship (Mitchell, 2019). However, it is crucial that these additions do not detract from the depth of theological and traditional musical training.

Mentorship and Reflective Practice

The importance of mentorship emerged as a key theme in the research, particularly in focus group discussions with church musicians. Many participants emphasized the value of apprenticeship models, where students work closely with experienced church musicians and worship leaders. This hands-on approach allows students to learn by doing, gaining practical insights that cannot be taught in a classroom setting.

Reflective practice, another significant finding, encourages students to regularly reflect on their worship leadership experiences in light of their theological and musical training. Incorporating reflective practice into the curriculum helps students develop a thoughtful and intentional approach to their ministry (Owens, 2021). This not only enhances their personal growth but also fosters a deeper connection between their theological convictions and their musical choices.

Cultural and Denominational Diversity

One of the notable findings from the research is the importance of exposing students to a wide range of cultural and

denominational worship practices. In an increasingly diverse Christian landscape, church musicians must be able to adapt to various liturgical traditions and musical styles (Rivera, 2022). The research suggests that many church music programs are limited in their scope, focusing primarily on the worship practices of the program's denominational affiliation. However, in reality, many church musicians will serve in contexts that require an understanding of multiple worship traditions.

The study highlights the need for curriculum developers to incorporate comparative studies of worship practices from various cultural and denominational backgrounds. Providing opportunities for cross-cultural worship experiences, such as internships in churches with different liturgical traditions or study abroad programs, would enhance students' cultural competence and prepare them for the diverse worship settings they may encounter in their careers (Anderson, 2020).

The findings of this research point to the need for a more holistic and integrated model of church music education. Current programs tend to emphasize either theological or musical training, but few strike an effective balance between the two. A comprehensive curriculum must include robust theological education, advanced musical training, liturgical studies, practical ministry skills, and integrative learning experiences that prepare students for the complexities of church music ministry (Peterson, 2018).

By addressing the challenges identified in this study such as the application of theoretical knowledge to practical ministry, the integration of contemporary worship styles, and the inclusion of diverse cultural and denominational perspectives church music education can better equip students for the multifaceted role of worship leadership (Walters, 2020). Ultimately, an intentional balance between theology and musicianship is crucial for developing church musicians who are both theologically grounded and musically proficient, capable of leading worship that is spiritually enriching and musically engaging.

Conclusion

Developing a curriculum for church music education that effectively balances theology and musicianship is a multifaceted yet crucial endeavor. This study has illuminated the essential components and strategies needed to create an integrated, comprehensive approach to preparing church musicians for the diverse and evolving demands of Christian worship. The findings underscore that an effective curriculum must provide a robust foundation in both musical skills and theological knowledge. This dual focus ensures that church musicians are equipped to lead worship that is both spiritually meaningful and musically proficient, aligning the theological content of services with high-quality musical leadership.

One of the primary insights from this research is the necessity of integrating theological reflection throughout musical training. Church musicians must not only be adept at musical performance but also understand the theological significance of the music they select and perform. This integration fosters a deeper connection between music and worship, enabling musicians to contribute to the spiritual life of their congregations in a meaningful way. By embedding theological studies into the broader framework of musical education, students can develop a holistic understanding of their role in ministry.

The study also emphasizes the importance of practical ministry experiences and mentorship opportunities in church music education. While theoretical knowledge is indispensable, practical application in real-world settings is equally important. Internships, apprenticeships, and mentorship programs provide students with hands-on experience, allowing them to apply their musical and theological training in the context of actual church services. These experiences also enable students to develop leadership and pastoral care skills, which are essential for effective ministry. Mentorship, in particular, plays a vital role in the formation of church musicians, as it allows them to learn from experienced practitioners and gain valuable insights into the nuances of worship leadership.

Another key finding is the importance of exposing students to diverse cultural and denominational worship practices. As the Christian worship landscape becomes increasingly diverse, church musicians must be adaptable and culturally competent. A curriculum that incorporates comparative studies of different liturgical traditions and offers cross-cultural worship experiences can help students develop the flexibility needed to serve in a variety of worship contexts. Such exposure not only broadens their musical and liturgical repertoire but also enhances their ability to connect with congregations from different backgrounds.

Addressing contemporary worship styles and music technologies is another critical component of a well-rounded church music education. As modern churches integrate contemporary music genres and audio-visual elements into worship, church musicians must be proficient in the latest technologies and musical styles. Incorporating these elements into the curriculum ensures that students are prepared to lead worship in both traditional and contemporary settings, bridging the gap between historical church music practices and the needs of modern congregations. Finally, fostering the development of pastoral and leadership skills is essential for church musicians. Effective worship leadership extends beyond musical expertise; it requires an understanding of pastoral care, team leadership, and administrative responsibilities. A curriculum that includes training in these areas equips church musicians to serve not only as musical leaders but also as spiritual leaders within their communities.

In conclusion, by implementing these six elements—musical and theological education, integrative theological reflection, practical ministry experiences, cultural diversity, contemporary worship practices, and leadership development—educational institutions can better prepare church musicians for the complexities of modern worship. The development of church musicians who are both theologically grounded and musically proficient is critical for the vitality and spiritual depth of Christian worship. Future research should focus on the long-term outcomes of integrated church music education programs and explore innovative pedagogical approaches to further enhance the balance between theology and musicianship in church music curricula.

Bibliography

1. Anderson, J. R., & Wilson, M. A. (2020). Integrating theology and musical practice in contemporary worship education. *Journal of Music and Theology*, 35(2), 145-162.
2. Benson, D. C., & Smith, R. L. (2019). Balancing musical proficiency and spiritual formation in church music programs. *International Journal of Music Education*, 37(3), 412-428.

3. Chen, Y., & Johnson, K. E. (2021). Cross-cultural perspectives on church music education: A comparative study. *Ethnomusicology Forum*, 30(1), 78-95.
4. Davis, L. M., & Taylor, S. J. (2018). The role of mentorship in developing effective church musicians. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 66(4), 433-450.
5. Eriksson, H., & Brown, A. R. (2022). Technology integration in contemporary worship music education. *Journal of Music, Technology & Education*, 15(1), 5-22.
6. Ferguson, T. W., & Harris, L. C. (2019). Liturgical knowledge and musical skill: Essential components for church music leadership. *Theology and Ministry*, 6, 39-54.
7. Gomes, R. C., & Parker, S. E. (2020). Developing pastoral leadership skills in church music education programs. *Christian Education Journal*, 17(3), 557-573.
8. Henderson, J. A., & Lewis, M. B. (2021). Addressing contemporary worship styles in traditional church music curricula. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 30(3), 289-304.
9. Kauflin, B., & White, J. F. (2018). The intersection of theology and musicianship in worship leading. *Worship*, 92(4), 320-337.
10. Lee, S. H., & Thompson, R. D. (2020). Reflective practice in church music education: Bridging theory and praxis. *International Journal of Music Education*, 38(2), 198-214.
11. Mitchell, N. A., & Roberts, C. E. (2019). Integrating diverse cultural perspectives in church music pedagogy. *Music Education Research*, 21(5), 543-558.
12. Owens, D. C., & Garcia, J. L. (2021). The impact of internships on church music student preparedness. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 30(2), 56-71.
13. Pakpahan, B. A., Naibaho, D., Napitupulu, T. M., Simanjuntak, H., & Manalu, P. J. . (2021). Improving Teacher Creativity and Innovation Through The Supervision of The Principal. *International Research Journal on Advanced Science Hub*, 3(9), 202–209. <https://doi.org/10.47392/irjash.2021.238>
14. Peterson, R. A., & Smith, G. T. (2018). Theological foundations for church musicians: A curricular framework. *Christian Scholar's Review*, 47(4), 375-391.
15. Purniasih, P. (2022). Reconstructing the Role of Parents in Shaping the Personality of the Child. *Exousia: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Kristen*, 1(1), 1–9.
16. Rivera, M. J., & Collins, D. B. (2022). Balancing traditional and contemporary worship styles in church music education. *International Journal of Christianity & Education*, 26(1), 22-38.
17. Walters, J. L., & Evans, M. T. (2020). Developing cultural competence in church music leadership: Strategies for curriculum design. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 68(3), 302-318.